



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

## NOTES AND COMMENT

Catholic historical students will rejoice in the honor conferred upon Father Joseph Michael Gleason, of Palo Alto, California, in his election to the presidency of the Pacific Coast Branch of the American Historical Association. Father Gleason was born on August 23, 1869, at San Francisco. He attended the Washington Grammar School and the Boys High School in that city, and studied at the Sacred Heart College and the College of St. Ignatius, from which latter institution he received the degree of M.A., in 1888. After finishing his theological course at St. Mary's Seminary, Baltimore, he was ordained to the priesthood, and then began graduate studies at the Catholic University of America, where he studied under Drs. Shahan, Pace, Grannan, and Hyvernat. Father Gleason's library is known to all bibliophiles and scholars on the Pacific coast. He has collected many rare volumes on Spanish-American history, and his library at Palo Alto merits a visit from all who are interested in that fascinating period of American development which culminates with the heroic figure of Junipero Serra, the Franciscan.

---

There is a bit of war romance connected with the publication of Dr. Rudolph Schuller's edition of Fray Benigno Bibblotti's *Moseteno Vocabulary and Treatises* (Northwestern University Press: Evanston and Chicago, 1917). Dr. Schuller had finished the rough draft of the Introduction and a revision of the MS. (which is taken from Northwestern University's collection of Boliviana) when the rupture of diplomatic relations between Austria-Hungary and the United States forced his withdrawal from this country. The work as it appears now has been revised by Drs. Edward and Lichtenstein of Northwestern and Dr. Michelson of the Smithsonian. To anyone acquainted with the international reputation of Dr. Schuller as a student of South American linguistics, the apology of Dr. Lichtenstein for the publication of the work seems hardly necessary. The scholarship of the present editors seems sufficient guarantee that Dr. Schuller will not have to make a complaint similar to the following one, which he made on the publication of his "*Yñerre*" o "*Stammvater*" dos *Indios Maynas* (Rio de Janeiro, 1912): "I was in Europe when this paper was published, so I could not oversee the proofs. It is very badly corrected by someone who doesn't know Portuguese."

The book itself is a useful contribution to the history of the South America of sixty or seventy years ago. The author was a missionary among the Indians of Bolivia and his manuscript consists of a vocabulary and three sermons in the Moseteno language, for the instruction of young missionaries, and a short life of the saintly Franciscan, Fray Pablo Mateo Cerdá. The work is a silent witness that the apostolic labors of the South American clergy of the past century—a period much slandered by contemporary writers—were but a continuation of the quiet zeal of their predecessors who had spent three and a half centuries of thankless labor in quest of heathen souls. The book is worthy of study.

---

In a previous issue (April, 1917, pp. 110-111), we called attention to the prospective volume of Rev. John F. O'Hara, C.S.C., of the University of Notre Dame, to be entitled *Readings in Latin American Church History*. Father O'Hara has kindly consented to our publishing some of the introductory notes he has made for this much needed work, and it is with pleasure we offer them to our readers.

# READINGS IN LATIN AMERICAN CHURCH HISTORY

## Introductory

### PERIOD OF DISCOVERY (1492-1525)

#### I. Religious motives in the enterprise.

##### 1. Declarations of Isabella and Jiménez.

CORTÉS, *Cartas de Relación*, p. 54 n.

##### 2. Alexander VI, in the Bull of Demarcation.

GÓMARA, *Hist. de las Indias*, p. 169.

##### 3. Letter of Columbus to the Pope.

*Col. de Documentos Inéditos*, 39:20.

##### 4. Cortés and Pizarro

CORTÉS, *o. c.*, p. 54.

ZAHM, *Along the Andes and Down the Amazon*, 454.

#### II. First fruits of the American Church.

##### Baptism of the first Indians in Spain.

GÓMARA, *o. c.*, 167.

CASTELLANOS, *Elegías de Varones Ilustres de Indias*, 22.

#### III. First provisions for missionaries.

##### 1. Padre Boil appointed Vicar Apostolic.

ENGELHARDT, *Missions and Missionaries of California*, vol. i, *Appendix*.

*Doc. in.*, 38:199; 30:180.

##### 2. Orders to monasteries to furnish chaplains and missionaries.

CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 22.

GÓMARA, 170.

*Doc. in.*, 30:20, 220, 201, 219, 31:99.

##### 3. Orders for Church ornaments and supplies.

*Doc. in.*, 30:174 *et seq.*

#### IV. Work of first missionaries.

##### 1. First Mass in the New World.

##### 2. Difficulties of P. Boil with Columbus.

*Doc. in.*, 30:180.

GÓMARA, *o. c.*, 170.

MENDIETA, *Hist. Eccl. Ind.*, 32, 33.

##### 3. Return of Boil to Spain.

GÓMARA, *o. c.*, 170.

CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 34.

##### 4. Baptism of Indians.

###### (a) Favorable reports.

GÓMARA, *o. c.*, 176.

CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 30-34, 51.

###### (b) Adverse testimony.

LAS CASAS, *Apologética Hist. de Indias*, 322.

5. *Repartimientos* intended as an aid to conversion.

QUINTANA, *Fray Bartolomé de las Casas*, 437, 438.

*Doc. in.*, 36:174.

6. Difficulties created by bad conduct of Spaniards.

*Doc. in.*, 35, 199-240.

7. Work of education.

*Doc. in.*, 31:194.

#### V. Permanent establishments in Santo Domingo, Puerto Rico and Cuba.

1. Convents, churches and hospitals.

*Doc. in.*, 31:478.

2. Renewed supply of missionaries.

*Doc. in.*, 39:166.

3. Literary work.

CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 45, 143.

4. Depopulation of Santo Domingo.

*Doc. in.*, 1:376, 386,

OVEDO, *Sumario de la Natural Historia de las Indias*, 474.

5. Criminals as immigrants.

*Doc. in.*, 36:162, 168; 38:386.

6. First Mass of Las Casas.

QUINTANA, *o. c.*, 434.

7. Disorders in Church affairs.

*Doc. in.*, 34:111.

#### VI. Ecclesiastics as civil rulers.

1. Cardinal Jiménez and Adrian VI.

*Cath. Hist. Rev.*, iii, 147, 150.

2. Fray Benito and Columbus.

BERNÁLDEZ, *Historia de los Reyes Católicos*.

3. Fonseca.

NAVARRETE, *Viajes y descubrimientos*, ii, 316.

BERNÁLDEZ, *o. c.*

*Cath. Hist. Rev.*, iii, 131-150.

4. Ovando.

*Doc. in.*, 30:512.

CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 46.

5. Inquisitorial powers.

GÓMARA, *o. c.*, 175.

6. The Jeronymite *audiencia*.

*Doc. in.*, 1:264, 7:391.

#### VII. The Church as protector of the Indians.

##### A. Preliminary steps.

1. Royal decrees on Indian labor.

*Doc. in.*, 31:206, 209, 214, 216; 36:174.

2. Decree for Indians to have their own towns.

*Doc. in.*, 32:79.

3. Regulations on slavery.

*Doc. in.*, 1:237; 10:545; 32:292, 304, 319, 329.

4. Sermon of Montesinos on slavery.

LAS CASAS, *Historia de las Indias*, lib. 3, c. 78.

5. Conversion of Las Casas to the cause of the Indians.

LAS CASAS, *o. c.*, lib. 3, c. 78.

6. Santo Domingo missionaries suggest reforms.  
*Doc. in.*, 1:347; 7:397.
7. Missionaries ordered to free all slaves.  
*Doc. in.*, 11:258.
- B. Colonies on the mainland for the protection of Indians.
  1. Dominicans at Chichiriviche.  
CASTELLANOS, 143.  
LAS CASAS, *Apologética Historia*, 642, 643.
  2. Franciscans at Cumaná.  
CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 143.
  3. War against the Caribs.  
*Doc. in.*, 1:439.
  4. Destruction of the monasteries caused by the depredations of Ojeda.  
LAS CASAS, *Apologética Historia*, 643.  
PETER MARTYR, *De Orbe Novo*, dec. 7, c. 4.  
CASTELLANOS, *o. c.*, 144, 145.
  5. Colony of Las Casas, and the Knights of the Golden Spur.  
*Doc. in.*, 7:65, 89.
- C. Reform on the islands.
  1. Number of Indians freed.  
*Doc. in.*, 1:374, 417, 421, 422, 436.
  2. Summary of agitation and reforms.  
GÓMARA, *op. cit.*, 290.

## PART I

### THE PERIOD OF CONQUEST

#### Chapter I

##### *Mexico*

- I. Missionaries in the train of Cortés. (1519-1524.)  
BERNAL DIAZ DEL CASTILLO, *Conquista de Nueva España*, 33.  
GÓMARA, *Conquista de Méjico*.  
MENDIETA, *Historia Eclesiástica Indiana*.
- II. Establishment of the Missions. (1524-1540.)
  1. Request of Cortés for missionaries.  
*Doc. in.*, 12:470.
  2. Bulls of Leo X and Adrian VI for Franciscans.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 192, 195.
  3. Appointment of first missionaries.
    - (a) Their selection.  
MOTOLINÍA, *Historia de los Indios de Nueva España*, 156, 161.
    - (b) Instructions from the Minister General.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 200.
  4. Arrival of Fray Martín de Valencia and eleven companions.  
DIAZ DEL CASTILLO, 241, 242.  
GÓMARA, *op. cit.*, 404-405, 450.
  5. Preparation for their work.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 99-102.  
VASQUEZ, *Cronica de la Provincia del Santísimo Nombre de Jesus de Guatemala . . .*, lib. 1, c. 11.

6. Assignment of missions.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 99, 100.
7. Obstacles to conversion.  
MOTOLINÍA, 14-30, 140, 145, 209, 254.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 501.
8. Aids to conversion.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 26, 73, 135.
9. Work of the missionaries.  
DÍAZ DEL CASTILLO, *op. cit.*, 310-311.  
GÓMARA, *op. cit.*, 449-451.
- i. Baptisms.
  - (a) Manner of instruction—the *doctrina*.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 27, 28, 164.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 496.
  - (b) Administration of Baptism.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 111.
  - (c) Children of chiefs baptized first.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 20.  
BENAVIDES, Memorial of 1634.
  - (d) Number of Indians baptized.  
MOTOLINÍA, 105-108.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 621.
  - (e) Controversy about ceremonies of Baptism.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 109-115.
- ii. The other Sacraments.
  - (a) Confirmation.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 279, 280.
  - (b) Matrimony.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 125-128.
  - (c) Penance.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 116-125, 165.
  - (d) Holy Eucharist.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 65, 124.
  - (e) Sick calls.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 202, 203.
- iii. Feasts and Processions.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 81, 178-184, 237, 247.
- iv. Education.  
GÓMARA, *Conquista de Méjico*, 453.
  - (a) Letters, etc.  
MOTOLINÍA, 215.  
PLANCHET, *La Cuestión Religiosa en Méjico*, 278.
  - (b) Music.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 213-215.
  - (c) Arts and crafts.  
MENDIETA, *op. cit.*, 403-408.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 217-218.  
BENAVIDES, Memorial of 1634, ms.
- v. Literary and scientific work of the friars.  
MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 2, 11, 97, 176, 181, 192, 200-209, 249-252; ix, xxii, xxvii.

- MENDIETA, xxvii, 550-552, 620.  
 SAHAGÚN, *Historia general de las cosas de Nueva España*,  
 part ii, c. 1, 2.
- vi. Building of churches and convents.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 81, 99, 178-180, 184, 237, 247.
- vii. Hospitals.  
 MOTOLINÍA, 81, 82, 131, 132, 235, 247.
- viii. Exploration.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 172-175.  
*Doc. in.*, 19:529.
- ix. Daily routine of the friars.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 127.  
 BENAVIDES, Memorial of 1634.
10. Difficulties of the friars with the Spanish colonists.  
*Doc. in.*, 10:451.  
 TERNEAUX-COMPANS., *Voyages*, 16:94.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 137, 161, 162, 166, 167.
11. Support of the missions.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 71, 82.
12. Renewed supply of missionaries.  
 (a) Franciscans.  
 MOTOLINÍA, 148, 169-171, 136, 235.  
 MENDIETA, 322.  
 (b) Dominicans.  
 GÓMARA, *op. cit.*, 404.
13. Martyrs.  
 GÓMARA, *op. cit.*, 450.  
 MOTOLINÍA, 221-228.
14. Christian life of the Indians.  
 MOTOLINÍA, *op. cit.*, 68, 128, 134, 135, 168, 169, 229-238,  
 218, 221.

It will easily be seen from this bibliographical guide which he is preparing for this volume, that Father O'Hara has determined to treat the whole question of Spanish-American history thoroughly and impartially. It is earnestly to be hoped that his lectures at Notre Dame University will not cause any delay in the publication of his work.

---

A singular fatality seems to have been attached to the manuscript remains of Bishop Bruté, the first Bishop of Vincennes. Born in Nemur, France, in 1779, he was a youth during the Reign of Terror and witnessed many of the atrocities of that period. After graduating in medicine and practising a few months, he entered the Seminary of St. Sulpice, Paris, and was ordained in 1808. He came to the United States in 1810. In 1814 he was President of St. Mary's Seminary and from 1818 until his consecration as the first Bishop of Vincennes was President of Mt. St. Mary's, Emmitsburg. He was consecrated October 28, 1834, in the Cathedral at St. Louis. While journeying from Vincennes to Baltimore in 1837, he contracted a severe cold which developed into tuberculosis, from which he died June 26, 1839.

It was the custom of Bruté to keep a Note Book into which he daily entered matters of occurrence, often illustrating them with sketches of memorable scenes. This he maintained until near his death. His Note Books, as well as his voluminous correspondence with Bishops England, Rosati, Flaget and Purcell, with Judge Gaston and other persons of prominence in ecclesiastical and civil life in the United States and Europe, as well as his Reports of his work in the new and undeveloped Diocese to the Leopoldian Association of Vienna, would have furnished the material for an extended biography of one of the most remarkable men who have graced the hierarchy in the United States, and would have added most interesting chapters to the history of the Church in this country. Bishop Bruté seems to have realized the value of his literary remains. It is said that he spent the last months of his life in arranging his papers for his literary executor, when failing strength made him unable to perform the active duties of pastor and bishop.

These papers he left to his successor, Bishop Hailandière, who was in Europe at the time of the death of Bruté. On the return of Bishop Hailandière the business of a See, now growing rapidly with the incoming Irish and German immigration, hindered any attention the successor might have desired to give to the papers of Bruté. Difficulties of administration induced Bishop Hailandière to resign his See in 1847 and he returned to France. While waiting in New York to sail, Bishop Hailandière prevailed upon Bishop Hughes of New York to prepare a Life of Bruté. The Bishop of New York had known Bruté intimately while a student at Mt. St. Mary's. In furtherance of his plan for the work, Hailandière had given orders to the priest in charge of Vincennes, to forward to New York the Bruté MS., and this was done. But the work of the New York Diocese was also pressing and the Life was not written. It being reported to Vincennes, after the death of Archbishop Hughes, that the MSS. were being scattered and in danger of loss, the authorities there, in 1864, requested the return of the papers. In the meantime Bishop Bayley, who at one time had been Secretary of Bishop Hughes, had prepared a small volume, *Memoirs of Bishop Bruté*, which was published by O'Shea in 1865. He had contemplated writing a Life of Bruté, but press of occupations did not permit him to carry out his design, and he contented himself with publishing as "Memoirs," the notes and reminiscences of the French Revolution, the diaries of Bruté and his accounts of his labors in the new Diocese, from his interesting Letters to the Leopoldine Association. The facts of his life and character are made up mainly from a Discourse of Dr. McCaffrey delivered after Bruté's death, and from notes in Brute's handwriting.

Some of Mss. of the Bruté was returned to Vincennes after the appearance of Bayley's *Memoris of Bruté*. The latter book, though a mere scrap book hastily compiled, was a fortunate publication, for it saved from destruction some of the most valuable writings of Brute. In 1870 a nephew of Bruté, the Rev. Paul Jansions, O.S.B., came from France to prepare a Life of his distinguished uncle. He had already published a small pamphlet containing a sketch of the great Bishop, and with such manuscripts as were then available from the collection returned from New York, and papers gathered in France, was prepar-



ing to write the *Life of Bruté*. While engaged in arranging his papers he was taken sick with typhoid fever, and died at Vincennes, September 7, 1870. All his papers, the gathering of several years, were boxed up and sent to the Benedictine Monastery of St. Meinrad, Ind., where they reposed undisturbed until consumed by the fire which destroyed the Abbey in 1887.

A young priest of the Diocese of Vincennes, Rev. Edmund J. Schmitt, who had unusual talent for historical research, began to gather material for a *Life of Bruté*, but he was obliged to go South for his health and died May 5, 1901. He left his manuscripts to Bishop Maes of Covington, but the latter was unable to undertake the work, and some months before his death sent the papers to the Bishop of Indianapolis. They are now in the possession of Notre Dame University. The writer of this does not know what Fr. Schmitt was able to collect. There must be extant many letters of Bruté scattered about the country, for he was a faithful correspondent in the days when familiar correspondence was still an art. But the materials which Bruté had himself arranged for an Autobiography or a *Life* are gone, except such as were fortunately printed in the *Memoirs of Bruté* by Bayley, and this book is now out of print.

What with diaries, Note Books and Sketches which he daily made, no man seems to have better prepared for his biography than Bruté. But with fine irony fate seems to have decreed otherwise, and the *Life* of one of the greatest men of the Church in the United States is, nearly eighty years after his death, still unwritten. But it is a tribute to his greatness, that so long a time after his death, the want of a *Life of Bruté* is still felt.

The Benedictines of New Subiaco Abbey, of New Subiaco, Ark., have very sensibly taken advantage of the Silver Jubilee of their first Abbot, the Rt. Rev. Ignatius Conrad, O.S.B., to issue a history of the Abbey for the past forty years (1878-1917)—*A Retrospect on the Occasion of the Silver Jubilee of Abbot Ignatius Conrad, O.S.B.* By Rev. Luke Hess, O.S.B. Subiaco, Ark., 1917, pp. 125. Father Luke Hess, the historian of the Community—the “walking chronicle,” as his brethren call him—has written a charming story of the success of the Abbey from its foundation. Numerous pictures of these early days, valuable also for the history of the Church in Arkansas, and several fine appendices are printed in the volume. The whole publication reflects credit on its author. Such works as these will be the authoritative sources for the history of religious life in the country.

We have received an artistic little volume, *Festschrift zum Silbernen Jubiläum (1892-1917) der Gemeinde Windthorst, Texas*, written by Rev. Frowin Koerd, O.S.B., the pastor. It is unusually well written and reminds one of the fact that the Order to which Father Koerd belongs has ever been foremost in all aspects of historical work.

A highly interesting, rare and instructive book (in the Congressional Library, Washington, D. C.) is the *Noticias de la Provincia de Californias en tres Cartas de un Sacerdote Religioso, Hijo del Real Convento de Predicadores de Valencia*.

(Valencia, 1794, 16mo, pp. 304.) This beautifully printed volume, as its title indicates, consists of three letters to a friend. The two first letters were written at San Miguel, a mission which was founded by the writer himself in 1787, was situated in northwestern Lower or Old California, and was the uppermost mission of the Dominicans in the peninsula, marking the line of division between their field of apostolic labors and that of the Franciscans, to whom belonged the care of the Indians of Upper or New California. The third and last document was probably begun at the same place, and continued during the author's journey to Europe. It was completed at San Miguel, in the Azores, whence it was forwarded to Valencia, Spain. The work is edited anonymously. None of the letters bear any date, but they were evidently written from 1787 to 1791-2. All of them have as signature simply "F. L. S." Historians, not without reason, have assigned them to the Dominican Father Luis Sales, whose name figures quite prominently in Lower California at this period. The first letter gives a description of the country and the character, manners and customs of the Indians through the peninsula and as far north as San Francisco. The second treats of the former Jesuit missions in Lower California, from their beginning in 1697, to their suppression in 1767, and the Franciscan charge of the Indians there from 1768 to 1773. The third gives an account of the succession of the Dominicans to the Franciscans, at the latter date, and of the progress made by the missions under the new regime until the time of Sales' departure. It is unfortunate that Father Sales' letters are in the nature of a descriptive history, rather than an attempt to present a connected historical narrative. It is, indeed, deeply to be regretted that he did not give the world a succinct history of Dominican missionary effort in Lower California during the years he was laboring there, for while we have good accounts of the Jesuit and Franciscan periods, scarcely anything authoritative has been written on that of the Dominicans. Father Sales was one of the first band of missionaries his Order sent to the peninsula, and the talent and keen observation shown in his letters, prove that he could have composed a splendid and authentic narrative of these friars' apostolic endeavors in that desolate portion of the globe. Had he done this, the lover of true history might have been spared much crude misrepresentation by Hubert Bancroft and others. However, Sales' letters afford much useful, interesting, and edifying information on the earnest exertions of these self-sacrificing missionaries, and show—as many claim they did—that they must have labored as effectually for the Indian, and accomplished as much good for religion, as either the Jesuits or the Franciscans. And these fruitful labors the friars of St. Dominic continued until they were deprived of all means of subsistence, and were forced to leave the country by the destructive secularization measures of the past century. There were many distinguished men among them. One of them, Father Cajetan Pallas, became Bishop of Nueva Segovia, in the Philippine Islands, in 1806. One of these days, perhaps, some patient and painstaking scholar will ransack Spanish archives for documents on this little known subject, and give the world another edifying chapter on what the Catholic Church has done for the welfare, both spiritual and temporal, of the American aborigines.

---

Again, American historical students are under a debt of gratitude to Miss Grace Gardner Griffin for her *Writings on American History* for 1915. Since 1906, these annual bibliographies have been published under the auspices of the Carnegie Institution of Washington. The series has been generously supported by a group of subscribers and friends. In those fields which are of particular interest to Catholic scholars—namely, religious history, education, fine arts, Latin America, etc., etc.—there is abundant material catalogued. There is hardly any work of a more practical nature being published at the present time than these annual catalogues, and they should be found in every Catholic college and university.

---

An interesting problem in the interdependence of sources was presented by Joaquín García Icazbalceta in his introduction to Mendieta's *Historia Eclesiástica Indiana*, which, though written in the latter part of the sixteenth century, was first printed by the Mexican scholar in 1870. Icazbalceta presented a table of comparisons to show that Torquemada's *Política Indiana*, written shortly after Mendieta's work, and immediately published, was very largely a verbatim copy of Mendieta's manuscript, with moralizing comments by the copyist. Icazbalceta recognized the dependence of Mendieta on earlier manuscripts, one of which, Motolinía's *Historia de los Indios de la Nueva España*, written between the years 1536 and 1541, and published by Lord Kingsborough in 1848, Icazbalceta had already republished in the first volume of his *Colección de Documentos para la Historia de México*. Another of the sources recognized by Mendieta and noted by Icazbalceta is the work of Olmos on the *Antiquities of Mexico*, which was finished before the work of Motolinía. The dependence of Torquemada and others on the earlier work of Motolinía was emphasized by Luís García Pimentel, the son and literary heir of Icazbalceta, when he published, in 1903, an earlier work of Motolinía, the *Memoriales*, which appears to be a rough draft of the *Historia de los Indios*; and the dependence of both Torquemada and Mendieta on Motolinía is noted by Fr. Daniel Sánchez García, in a third issue of the *Historia de los Indios*, published at Barcelona in 1914.

---

Equally interesting bibliographical material could have been found by these scholarly editors if they had compared these earlier texts with the monumental work of Las Casas, the *Apologética Historia de Las Indias*, which, though written before 1555, remained in manuscript until 1909. In his treatment of Mexican antiquities in this work, Las Casas uses at least two previous sources, Olmos and Motolinía. He acknowledges the work of both of these authors, though in the case of Motolinía at least his acknowledgement is very sparing for the amount of textual similarity he displays. About one-half of his treatment of Mexico is taken from a source or sources other than Motolinía, and the fact that he acknowledges one section of it as coming from Olmos, leads us to hope that much more of the lost text of this writer may be reconstructed from his pages. Incidentally, this particular section, which is made up of a series of letters indicative of the culture of the Aztecs, is repeated in Mendieta without the acknowledgment of any source. There is still another interesting

point that was missed by Pimentel and his learned collaborators who edited the text of the *Memoriales*. It is certain, from textual identity, that Las Casas used the *Memoriales*, and not the *Historia*, of Motolinía, and yet the passage which he attributes to the latter, a description of the Corpus Christi processions at Tlaxcala, in 1538 (Las Casas says 1536), does not occur in the *Memoriales*, while a modified and more polished form of the narrative is given by Motolinía in the *Historia de los Indios*. The solution of this problem is offered by Motolinía himself. In part 1, ch. 33, page 92, of the *Memoriales*, he promises to give the description of the Corpus Christi festivities in chapter 38; but in ch. 38 of the Pimentel edition, a new subject is introduced. It is hard to escape the conclusion that the manuscript used by Pimentel is defective in this particular. It is interesting to note that until now all contributions to this "bibliographical romance" have had reference to the work of the Franciscans, since Olmos, Motolinía, Mendieta and Torquemada were all sons of St. Francis. The introduction of the Dominican Las Casas into the problem should add greatly to its interest.

---

The necessity for thorough and impartial treatment of Las Casas, in English, already noted as a desideratum in the columns of the CATHOLIC HISTORICAL REVIEW, is becoming more apparent every day. Francis Augustus MacNutt's *Bartholomew de las Casas* (New York, 1909) follows the Quintana ideal of hero-worship, while the article by Bandelier in the *Catholic Encyclopedia* is probably too severe against the Defender of the Indians. The fairest, and doubtless the best, appreciation of Las Casas in English is the lengthy sketch in Vol. i of Thacher's *Columbus*. Fray Daniel Sánchez García, in his introduction to the reprint of Motolinía's *Historia de los Indios de la Nueva España* (Barcelona, 1914), has the following significant paragraph:

Someone has characterized the writings of Padre Las Casas as so many defamatory libels against Spain. Be this as it may, it appears indisputable that while there is much in them that is true, there is much more that is exaggerated, not to say false; and it is on these exaggerations or falsehoods that the enemies and detractors of Spain have based their charges of unheard-of cruelties that she never committed. Fortunately, the authority of Las Casas is daily losing ground, as the history of the conquest becomes better known, and its course weighed in the balance of historical criticism. Nevertheless, there are still among us those who accept the gratuitous assertions of Las Casas as Gospel truth, without regard to the testimony of the great Bishop Marroquín, of Bernal Díaz del Castillo and a thousand others, in particular of Padre Motolinía, at least as good a friend and enthusiastic a defender of the Indians as Las Casas could have been.

It is interesting to note in this connection that Las Casas, in copying Motolinía's description of the sacrifices to the gods of fire and water (Las Casas, *Apologética Historia de los Indios*, ch. 171; Motolinía, *Memoriales*, part I, ch. 19; *Historia de los Indios*, ch. 7), omits, certainly with deliberation, some passages of the original that tend to emphasize the cruelty of the Indians; and it may be said in passing that no credit is given by the copyist to the author of the original.

A collected story of the different efforts to establish French colonies in the United States still remains unwritten. That story stretches from Maine to Louisiana, and contains the early records of Kaskaskia and Cahokia in the Mississippi Valley, Vincennes, Detroit, Biloxi, the Acadian Exiles, the account of the French Republic at New Orleans in 1766, and a number of other attempts such as that at Gallipolis in 1791. Margry's six volumes on the *Découvertes et Etablissements des Français dans l'ouest et dans le sud de l'Amérique septentrionale* 1614-1754 (Paris, 1888) are a basic source for such a work. It is a sad story; for practically all these attempts were failures, and one of the most pathetic is that of Gallipolis, which we have already treated in these pages and which is fully described in the *Centennial of Gallipolis*, published by the Ohio Archeological and Historical Society (Columbus, 1895). *The Story of Some French Refugees and their Colony of Azilum* (1793-1800), by Louise Montgomery (Athens, Pa., 1903), has many human touches, and the fate of the colony, of which hardly a trace remains, adds but another melancholy page to this little known aspect of early colonization. Rosengarten, in his *French Colonists and Exiles in the United States* (Phila., 1907), has attempted to bind together the scattered threads of these projects, all of which have a place in the history of Catholicity in the United States; but the work needs to be done from the Catholic standpoint, if it is to be true to life.

---

The knowledge of the existence of a complete set of Stevens' *Facsimiles of Manuscripts in European Archives relating to America* (1773-1783) is of value to every scholar in the vicinity of the collection which contains the set. Stevens' plan to furnish facsimiles of American documents of importance from the Archives of England, France, Holland, and Spain, astonished historical scholars the world over by its audacity. His project embraced one hundred volumes, and recently through the great generosity of a friend, the Catholic University of America has received the twenty-five volumes which were published in 1889-98. These volumes are a storehouse to the American historian, and the foreign relations of our government during the Peace Negotiations can never be fully grasped until all these documents are analyzed. Benjamin Franklin Stevens had been a resident of London for many years, when he presented his plan to our Government in 1882, and again in 1884, of securing copies of the 80,000 documents relating to the War of Independence and the Peace Negotiations (1763-1783), from the Archives of England, Holland, Spain and France. His project was not accepted by the Government.

---

*The Old Jesuit Mission in Council Bluffs*, by Rev. Francis Cassilly, S.J., is an important chapter in the life of Father De Smet, S.J., the great "Black Robe" of the West. The source material for the history of the Council Bluffs Mission grows from year to year. Interest may yet be aroused to mark the site of the first church in Western Iowa by a suitable memorial to its great missionary. Father John O'Neill of Council Bluffs has won a place for himself in American Catholic historical work by his patriotic endeavor to resurrect the past of his locality.

---

An accomplished historian, Father Francis Betten, S.J., of St. Ignatius College, Cleveland, Ohio, writes to the Editor that the REVIEW deserves the general and generous support of all American Catholics, and offers the following striking suggestion:

"I wish to give expression to an idea which has long been in my mind, and which I think you can bring to realization. The REVIEW is too high for the ordinary reader. It is a *Fachzeitschrift* in the full sense and best sense of the word. The study of American Church history is not forced upon the Catholic, as is in some way the study of religion. If there is to be a class of professional historians in this country, it must have for its backing a numerous class of persons actively interested in history, of amateur historians if you wish. If such a class is created the learned masters will have an audience to whom they may communicate the result of their studies and researches. But nobody is interested in a thing of which he knows either nothing or very little. The instruction given in the schools is a good foundation, especially if based on a truly Catholic book. But it is not enough. Religious knowledge must constantly be rehearsed and complemented by sermons and books, etc. So it seems to me historical knowledge requires rehearsing and complementing after the schoolbook has been thrown aside—sometimes with many sighs of relief. Unfortunately our Catholic press is neglected; but it is a power all the same. It could be utilized for our purpose. The means is the *popular article* and still more, perhaps, the *short story*. Such papers do not necessarily require great knowledge, much less original researches. All they need is supervision and direction. A regular crusade of such contributions to our Catholic papers might be started. But the contributors must not expect much in the line of financial success for themselves. The papers will not pay as a rule. Don't you think the Catholic University could give out the watchword for this crusade and even organize it as far as possible? If, afterwards, other agencies would take it up and start similar movements in their respective spheres, so much the better—*Raum für alle hat die Erde*. The attention of those who have charge of college and high school papers might also be called to this point."

Father Betten gave a strong proof of his interest in historical work, when he undertook in 1915 to review West's *Ancient World*. The publishers, Allyn and Bacon, he says, have been most sympathetic, and all the alterations suggested by him have been adopted. Father Betten is now engaged on a revision of another volume by the same author.

---

The following pamphlets have been sent to the Library of the American Church History Academy: JOHN F. DAVIS, *The History of California*, reprint from *The Pacific Ocean in History*. New York, 1915; HERBERT E. BOLTON, *The Location of La Salle's Colony on the Gulf of Mexico*, reprint from the *Mississippi Valley Historical Review* (September, 1915), *The Early Explorations of Father Garces on the Pacific Slope*, from *The Pacific Ocean in History* (New York, 1917), and *French Intrusions into New Mexico (1749-52)*, from the same publication. (New York, 1917.)